Classifying small index subfactors UC Riverside

David Penneys University of Toronto

February 27, 2014

David Penneys Classifying small index subfactors

A (10) > (10)

・ロト ・回ト ・ヨト

-

Invariants of subfactors



イロン イヨン イヨン イヨン

II_1 -factors

Definitions

- A von Neumann algebra is a *-closed subalgebra $M \subseteq B(H)$ such that M = M''.
- A factor is a von Neumann algebra with trivial center $Z(M) = M' \cap M = \mathbb{C}1.$
- A II₁-factor M is an infinite dimensional factor with a tracial state $tr: M \to \mathbb{C}$.
- A subfactor is a unital inclusion of factors.

Our subfactors will be II_1 -subfactors.

・ロト ・日本 ・モート ・モート

Index for subfactors

Definition

Given a II₁-subfactor $A \subset B$, we say it has finite index if B is a finitely generated projective A-module. The index [B : A] is the trace of the corresponding idempotent in $K_0(A)^+$.

Theorem [Jon83]

For a II₁-subfactor $A \subset B$,

$$[B\colon A] \in \left\{4\cos^2\left(\frac{\pi}{n}\right) \middle| n = 3, 4, \dots\right\} \cup [4, \infty].$$

イロト イヨト イヨト イヨト

Where do subfactors come from?

Some examples include:

- Groups from $G \curvearrowright R$, we get $R^G \subset R$ and $R \subset R \rtimes_{\alpha} G$.
- finite dimensional unitary Hopf/Kac algebras
- Quantum groups
- Conformal field theory
- endomorphisms of Cuntz C*-algebras

However, there are certain possible infinite families without uniform constructions.

Remark

Just as von Neumann algebras come in pairs (M, M'), subfactors come in pairs $(A \subset B, B' \subset A')$.

イロン イヨン イヨン イヨン

The standard invariant

Definition

The standard invariant of $A \subset B$ is the the following unitary 2-category:

- Objects: A and B
- <u>1-Morphisms</u>: bimodules generated by $_AB_B$ and $_BB_A$ (take tensor products and decompose into irreducible summands)
- 2-Morphisms: bimodule intertwiners
- unitary structure: Adjoint on A, B is identity. Adjoint on bimodules is the contragredient, giving an involution on A - A and B - B bimodules, but swaps A - B and B - A bimodules. Adjoint on intertwiners is usual adjoint.

Choosing our favorite 1-morphism $_AB_B$ gives a planar algebra.

Principal graphs

Definition

Given the 1-morphism ${}_AB_B$, we define the principal graph of $A\subset B$ as follows.

- Even vertices: isomorphism classes of simple A A bimodules.
- <u>Odd vertices</u>: isomorphism classes of simple A B bimodules.
- Edges: dim(Hom_{A-B}($P \otimes_A B, Q$)) unoriented edges from $\overline{_AP_A}$ to $_AQ_B$.
- Get the dual principal graph by looking at ${}_BB_A$ together with B-B and B-A bimodules.
- Can define the fusion graph with respect to any simple bimodule.

Examples

Examples of principal graphs

- index < 4: A_n, D_{2n}, E_6, E_8 . No D_{odd} or E_7 .
- index = 4: $A_{2n-1}^{(1)}, D_{n+2}^{(1)}, E_6^{(1)}, E_7^{(1)}, E_8^{(1)}, A_\infty, A_\infty^{(1)}, D_\infty$
- Graphs for $R \subset R \rtimes G$ obtained from G and $\operatorname{Rep}(G)$.





- First graph is principal, second is dual principal.
- Leftmost vertex is the trivial bimodule ${}_{A}A_{A}$, ${}_{B}B_{B}$ resp.
- Red tags for duality of A A and B B vertices.
- Duality of A B to B A is by depth and height

・ロン ・回 と ・ ヨン ・ ヨン

Finite depth

Definition

If the principal graph is finite, then the subfactor and standard invariant/planar algebra are called finite depth.

Example: $R \subset R \rtimes G$ for finite G

For $G = S_3$:

- Principal graph: – 📢
- Dual principal graph: ←²/

・ロト ・回 ト ・ヨト ・ヨト

Supertransitivity

Definition

We say a principal graph is *n*-supertransitive if it begins with an initial segment consisting of the Coxeter-Dynkin diagram A_{n+1} , i.e., an initial segment with n edges.



Known subfactors



- Recent classification to index 5 (contributed to parts 2 and 4) [MS12, MPPS12, IJMS12, PT12]
- Map of known subfactors from Jones-Morrison-Snyder survey [JMS13], to appear Bulletin AMS.

Planar algebras [Jon99]

Definition

- A shaded planar tangle has
 - a finite number of inner boundary disks
 - an outer boundary disk
 - non-intersecting strings
 - a marked interval \star on each boundary disk
 - a checkerboard shading



Composition of tangles

We can compose planar tangles by insertion of one into another if the number of strings matches up:



Definition

The *shaded planar operad* consists of all shaded planar tangles (up to isotopy) with the operation of composition.

Definition

A *planar algebra* is a family of vector spaces $P_{k,\pm}$, k = 0, 1, 2, ... and an action of the shaded planar operad.



◆□ > ◆□ > ◆臣 > ◆臣 > ○

Example: Temperley-Lieb

 $TL_{n,\pm}(\delta)$ is the complex span of non-crossing pairings of 2n points arranged around a circle, with formal addition and scalar multiplication.

$$TL_{3,+}(\delta) = \operatorname{Span}_{\mathbb{C}}\left\{ \underbrace{\star}_{\mathcal{O}}, \underbrace{\star}_{\mathcal{O}}, \underbrace{\star}_{\mathcal{O}}, \underbrace{\star}_{\mathcal{O}}, \underbrace{\star}_{\mathcal{O}}, \underbrace{\star}_{\mathcal{O}}, \underbrace{\star}_{\mathcal{O}} \right\}.$$

Planar tangles act on TL by inserting diagrams into empty disks, smoothing strings, and trading closed loops for factors of δ .

Subfactor planar algebras

Definition

A planar algebra P_{\bullet} is a subfactor planar algebra if it is:

- Finite dimensional: $\dim(P_{k,\pm}) < \infty$ for all k
- Evaluable: $P_{0,\pm}\cong\mathbb{C}$ by sending the empty diagram to $1_{\mathbb{C}}$
- Sphericality:

• Positivity: each $P_{k,\pm}$ has an adjoint * such that the sesquilinear form $\langle x, y \rangle := \text{Tr}(y^*x)$ is positive definite

From these properties, it follows that closed circles count for a multiplicative constant $\delta \in \{2\cos(\pi/n) | n \ge 3\} \cup [2, \infty)$.

・ロト ・回ト ・ヨト ・ヨト

Planar algebras from tensor categories

Definition

Given a unitary fusion category and a choice of simple object X, we get a planar algebra by setting

 $P_{n,+} = \operatorname{Hom}(1, (X \otimes \overline{X})^{\otimes n})$ and $P_{n,-} = \operatorname{Hom}(1, (\overline{X} \otimes X)^{\otimes n})$

- The strand is the identity 1-morphsim: $id_X = |$ and $id_{\overline{X}} = |$
- Caps are evaluation $ev_X = \bigcap$ and $ev_{\overline{X}} = \bigcap$
- Cups are coevaluation $\operatorname{coev}_X = \bigcup$ and $\operatorname{coev}_{\overline{X}} = \bigcup$
- Vertical join is composition gf = f

• Horizontal join is tensor product $f \otimes g = f g$

An example tangle

If $f \in P_{n,+} = \text{Hom}(1, (X \otimes \overline{X})^{\otimes n})$, the tangle below is a composite map, read from bottom to top:



$$\begin{split} & \operatorname{id}_{(X\otimes\overline{X})^{\otimes n}}\otimes\operatorname{ev}_{\overline{X}} \\ & \operatorname{id}_{(X\otimes\overline{X})^{\otimes n}\otimes X}\otimes\operatorname{ev}_{X}\otimes\operatorname{id}_{\overline{X}} \\ & \operatorname{id}_{X\otimes\overline{X}}\otimes f\otimes\operatorname{id}_{X\otimes\overline{X}} \\ & \operatorname{id}_{X}\otimes\operatorname{coev}_{\overline{X}}\otimes\operatorname{id}_{\overline{X}} \\ & \operatorname{coev}_{X} \end{split}$$

▲御★ ▲注★ ▲注★

Small index subfactor classification program



Focuses of the classification program:

- Enumerate graph pairs and apply obstructions.
- Construct examples when graphs survive.
- Place exotic examples into families.

< ≣⇒

< A

The extended Haagerup subfactor

Bigelow-Morrison-Peters-Snyder, [BMPS12]

The extended Haagerup subfactor is the unique subfactor with principal graphs



- Last remaining possible graph in Haagerup's classification to $3 + \sqrt{3}$ [Haa94] by work of Asaeda-Yasuda [AY09].
- Largest known supertransitivity outside the A and D series.
- Its planar algebra was constructed using Bigelow's jellyfish algorithm.

Bigelow-Morrison-Peters-Snyder, [BMPS12]

The Haagerup and extended Haagerup subfactor planar algebras have a generator $S \in P_{n,+}$ where n = 4, 8 respectively satisfying:



The jellyfish algorithm

We can evaluate all closed diagrams as follows:

First, pull all generators to the outside using the jellyfish relations



Second, reduce the number of generators using the capping and absorption (multiplication) relations.

Consistency and positivity

Theorem [Jones-Penneys [JP11], Morrison-Walker]

Every subfactor planar algebra embeds in the graph planar algebra of its principal graph.

This serves two purposes:

- **1** To show the planar algebra is non-zero, give a representation.
- Graph planar algebras are always finite dimensional, spherical, and positive. Only need to check evaluable.

▲ □ ► ▲ □ ►

Spoke graphs

Examples of spoke principal graphs

- A_n, D_{2n}, E_6, E_8 ,
- $E_6^{(1)}, E_7^{(1)}, E_8^{(1)}$
- $A_{\infty}, A_{\infty}^{(1)}, D_{\infty}$
- Principal graphs for $R \subset R \rtimes G$, G finite $(-\ll, -\ll)$
- Haagerup 333 ----

- 4442 -----
- extended Haagerup 733 -----

・ロト ・回ト ・ヨト ・ヨト

2

Spokes and jellyfish

Assume all generators of P_{\bullet} are at the same depth n.

Theorem [Bigelow-Penneys [BP14]]

• P_{\bullet} has 2-strand jellyfish relations \Leftrightarrow one graph is a spoke.



• P_{\bullet} has 1-strand jellyfish relations \Leftrightarrow both graphs are spokes.



Constructing spoke subfactors with jellyfish

Theorem [Morrison-Penneys [MP13]]

We automate finding 1-strand relations for these subfactors:



For the above, both principal graphs are the same spoke graph.

イロン イ部ン イヨン イヨン 三日

Constructing spoke subfactors with jellyfish, part 2

Theorem [Penneys-Peters [PP13]]

We give explicit 2-strand relations for the following subfactors:

< ≣⇒

< A

æ

Small index subfactor classification program



Focuses of the classification program:

- Enumerate graph pairs and apply obstructions.
- Construct examples when graphs survive.
- Place exotic examples into families.

Why do we care about index $3 + \sqrt{5?}$

• Standard invariants at index 4 are completely classified.

• $\mathbb{Z}/2 * \mathbb{Z}/2 = D_{\infty}$ is amenable

- Standard invariants at index 6 are wild.
 - There is (at least) one standard invariant for every normal subgroup of the modular group $\mathbb{Z}/2 * \mathbb{Z}/3 = PSL(2,\mathbb{Z})$
 - There are unclassifiably many distinct hyperfinite subfactors with the same standard invariant [BNP07, BV13]
- $4 = 2 \times 2$ and $6 = 2 \times 3$ are composite indices, as is $3 + \sqrt{5} = 2\tau^2$ where $\tau = \frac{1+\sqrt{5}}{2}$.

・ロト ・回ト ・ヨト ・ヨト

1-supertransitive subfactors at index $3 + \sqrt{5}$

Theorem [Liu13], partial proof by Izumi-Morrison-Penneys [IMP13]

There are exactly seven 1-supertransitive subfactor planar algebras with index $3+\sqrt{5}:$

- (--, --) self-dual
- (\checkmark , \sim) and its dual
- ($\checkmark \checkmark \checkmark \cdots, \checkmark \checkmark \checkmark \cdots)$ and its dual

These are all the standard invariants of composed inclusions of A_3 and A_4 subfactors.

Open question

Are there infinitely many distinct hyperfinite subfactors with the same standard invariant at index $3 + \sqrt{5}$?

• $A_3 * A_4$ and $A_2 * T_2$ are not amenable [HI98].

▲□ ▶ ▲ □ ▶ ▲ □ ▶

1-supertransitive with index at most $6\frac{1}{5}$

Theorem [Liu-Morrison-Penneys [LMP13]]

An exactly 1-supertransitive subfactor planar algebra with index at most $6\frac{1}{5}$ either comes from a composed inclusion (and has index $3 + \sqrt{5}$ or 6), or is one of 3 self-dual planar algebras at index $3 + 2\sqrt{2}$:



- Can push classification results above index 6!
- Could hope that the only wildness at index 6 is "group-like"

Index $(5, 3 + \sqrt{5})$

Conjecture [Morrison-Peters] [MP12]

There are exactly two non Temperley-Lieb subfactor planar algebras in the index range $(5,3+\sqrt{5})$:

name	Principal graphs	Index	Constructed	
$SU(2)_5$	$(\prec \mathbb{Z}, \prec \mathbb{Z})$	5.04892	[Wen90], [MP12]	
$SU(3)_4$	$\left \left(\underbrace{ \cdots \Longleftrightarrow}, \underbrace{ \cdots \diamondsuit} \right) \right.$	5.04892	[Wen88], [MP12]	

Theorem [Morrison-Peters] [MP12]

There is exactly one 1-supertransitive subfactor in the index range $(5,3+\sqrt{5})$

・ロト ・回ト ・ヨト ・ヨト

Subfactor planar algebras at index $3 + \sqrt{5}$

Conjecture [Morrison-Penneys]

At $3 + \sqrt{5}$, we have only the following subfactor planar algebras:

name	Principal graphs	#	Constructed
4442	(2	[MP13], Izumi
$3^{\mathbb{Z}/2 \times \mathbb{Z}/2}$	$(\Leftarrow = , \Leftarrow =)$	2	Izumi, [MP13]
$3^{\mathbb{Z}/4}$	(<-)	2	Izumi, [PP13]
2D2	$(\downarrow $	2	Izumi, [MPP]
$A_3 \otimes A_4$	(\prec , \prec)	1	\otimes
fish 2	$(\prec \swarrow, \rightarrow)$	2	BH
fish 3	$(\checkmark \checkmark \land $	2	[IMP13]
$A_3 * A_4$		2	[BJ97]
A_{∞}		1	[Pop93]

• The 1-supertransitive case is known by [Liu13, IMP13]

Subfactor planar algebras at index 6

Wildly optimistic conjecture [Penneys-Peters-Snyder]

At index 6, a $\geq 2\text{-supertransitive subfactor planar algebra is one of}$

name	Principal graphs		
A_5b	$\left(\underbrace{ \cdots \Longleftrightarrow}, \underbrace{ \cdots \diamondsuit} \right)$		
S_5b	$\left(\underbrace{- + + \underbrace{ \left< \cdot \right>}_{i}, - + - \underbrace{ \left< \cdot \right>}_{i} \right) \right)$		
$A_5 \subset A_6$	$(<\!$		
$S_5 \subset S_6$	$\left(\underbrace{ \cdots \cdots \end{array} \\ } \underbrace{ \left(\cdots \cdots \end{array} \right) } \right)$		

Theorem [LMP13]

If a subfactor has principal graphs an extension of (-< >, -< >), then it is a Bisch-Haagerup subfactor of the form $R^{\mathbb{Z}/2} \subset R \rtimes \mathbb{Z}/3$.

- We do not yet understand composed inclusions of A_3 and A_5 .
- No subfactor with principal graph → ← [EG12].

Subfactors Planar algebras Jellyfish and spokes $3 + \sqrt{5}$ Why $3 + \sqrt{5}$? Conjectures A new obstruction

How can we prove these conjectures?

Biggest hurdle: need to eliminate certain weeds. *10 weeds:



*11 weeds:



David Penneys Classifying small index subfactors

◆□ > ◆□ > ◆三 > ◆三 > 三 の < ⊙

Triple points

Fact

If the graph starts with a triple point at depth n-1, e.g.



then the planar algebra has an uncappable rotational eigenvector at depth n with eigenvalue ω_S where $\omega_S^n = 1$.



 If there is no merging two past the branch, we get a strong constraint in terms of the structure of the graph and ω_S .

▶ ★ E ▶ ★ E ▶ E

New obstruction

Theorem [Pen13]

(1) If
$$(\Gamma_+, \Gamma_-)$$
 is a translated extension of
 $(\check{r}-1)\frac{r}{\check{r}} + \frac{(\sigma_S + \sigma_S^{-1})}{[n]}\frac{\sqrt{r}}{\sqrt{\check{r}}} = \frac{r[n] - [n+2]}{[n]}.$
(2) If (Γ_+, Γ_-) is a translated extension of
 $(\underbrace{\cdot \cdot \cdot \cdot \cdot}_{\cdot}, \underbrace{\cdot \cdot \cdot \cdot}_{\cdot} \underbrace{\cdot \cdot \cdot}_{\cdot})$, then
 $(r-1) + \frac{(\sigma_S + \sigma_S^{-1})}{[n]} = \frac{[n+2] - r[n]}{r[n]}.$

 σ_S is the chirality (σ_S^2 is rotational eigenvalue) r, \check{r} are the branch factors (ratio of dimensions past branch)

Remaks on the new obstruction

• The key is the rotation



- The obstruction is far more general. Recovers results of Jones and Snyder.
- Key relation in the proof due to Liu, which is a variant of a relation due to Wenzl.
- This obstruction eliminates the *11 weeds
- Can obtain rotational eigenvalues for most small index subfactors.
- Gives easy non-existence result for D_{odd} and E_7 .

Thank you for listening!

Recent articles:

- with Bigelow Spokes and jellyfish Math. Ann. MR3157990
- with Morrison Constructing spokes with 1-strand jellyfish - to appear **Trans. AMS** - arXiv:1208.3637
- with Peters Constructing spokes with 2-strand jellyfish -Submitted - arXiv:1308.5197
- with Izumi and Morrison 1-supertransitive at $3+\sqrt{5}$ Submitted arXiv:1308.5723
- with Liu and Morrison 1-supertransitive below $6\frac{1}{5}$ Submitted arXiv:1310.8566
- new obstruction Submitted arXiv:1307.5890

・ロン ・回と ・ヨン ・ヨン

- Marta Asaeda and Seidai Yasuda, On Haagerup's list of potential principal graphs of subfactors, Comm. Math. Phys. 286 (2009), no. 3, 1141–1157, MR2472028
 DOI:10.1007/s00220-008-0588-0 arXiv:0711.4144.
- Dietmar Bisch and Vaughan F. R. Jones, Algebras associated to intermediate subfactors, Invent. Math. 128 (1997), no. 1, 89–157, MR1437496.
- Stephen Bigelow, Scott Morrison, Emily Peters, and Noah Snyder, Constructing the extended Haagerup planar algebra, Acta Math. 209 (2012), no. 1, 29–82, MR2979509, arXiv:0909.4099, DOI:10.1007/s11511-012-0081-7. MR 2979509
- Dietmar Bisch, Remus Nicoara, and Sorin Popa, *Continuous families of hyperfinite subfactors with the same standard invariant*, Internat. J. Math. **18** (2007), no. 3, 255–267,

MR2314611 arXiv:math.OA/0604460 DOI:10.1142/S0129167X07004011.

- Stephen Bigelow and David Penneys, Principal graph stability and the jellyfish algorithm, Math. Ann. 358 (2014), no. 1-2, 1-24, MR3157990, DOI:10.1007/s00208-013-0941-2, arXiv:1208.1564. MR 3157990
- Arnaud Brothier and Stefaan Vaes, *Families of hyperfinite* subfactors with the same standard invariant and prescribed fundamental group, 2013, arXiv:1309.5354.
- David E. Evans and Terry Gannon, Near-group fusion categories and their doubles, 2012.
- Frederick M. Goodman, Pierre de la Harpe, and Vaughan F.R. Jones, *Coxeter graphs and towers of algebras*, Mathematical Sciences Research Institute Publications, 14. Springer-Verlag, New York, 1989, x+288 pp. ISBN: 0-387-96979-9, MR999799.

Uffe Haagerup, Principal graphs of subfactors in the index range $4 < [M:N] < 3 + \sqrt{2}$, Subfactors (Kyuzeso, 1993), World Sci. Publ., River Edge, NJ, 1994, MR1317352 available at http: //tqft.net/other-papers/subfactors/haagerup.pdf,

pp. 1–38.

- Richard Han, A construction of the "2221" planar algebra, 2011, arXiv:1102.2052.
- Fumio Hiai and Masaki Izumi, Amenability and strong amenability for fusion algebras with applications to subfactor theory, Internat. J. Math. 9 (1998), no. 6, 669–722, MR1644299.
- Masaki Izumi, Vaughan F. R. Jones, Scott Morrison, and Noah Snyder, Subfactors of index less than 5, Part 3: Quadruple points, Comm. Math. Phys. **316** (2012), no. 2, 531–554,

MR2993924, arXiv:1109.3190, DOI:10.1007/s00220-012-1472-5. MR 2993924

- Masaki Izumi, Scott Morrison, and David Penneys, *Fusion* categories between $C \boxtimes D$ and c * d., 2013, arXiv:1308.5723.
- Vaughan F. R. Jones, Scott Morrison, and Noah Snyder, The classification of subfactors of index at most 5, 2013, arXiv:1304.6141, to appear Bulletin of the AMS.
- Vaughan F. R. Jones, Index for subfactors, Invent. Math. 72 (1983), no. 1, 1–25, MR696688, DOI:10.1007/BF01389127.

_____, *Planar algebras I*, 1999, arXiv:math/9909027.

 Vaughan F. R. Jones and David Penneys, The embedding theorem for finite depth subfactor planar algebras, Quantum Topol. 2 (2011), no. 3, 301–337, arXiv:1007.3173, MR2812459, DOI:10.4171/QT/23.

- Zhengwei Liu, Composed inclusions of a₃ and a₄ subfactors, 2013, arXiv:1308.5691.
- Zhengwei Liu, Scott Morrison, and David Penneys,
 1-supertransitive subfactors with index at most 6¹/₅, 2013,
 arXiv:1310.8566.
- Scott Morrison and Emily Peters, The little desert? Some subfactors with index in the interval (5, 3 + √5), 2012, arXiv:1205.2742.
- Scott Morrison and David Penneys, Constructing spoke subfactors using the jellyfish algorithm, 2013, arXiv:1208.3637, Accepted to Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. Jan. 18.
- Scott Morrison, David Penneys, and Emily Peters, Equivariantizations and 3333 spoke subfactors at index 3 + √5, In preparation.

- Scott Morrison, David Penneys, Emily Peters, and Noah Snyder, Subfactors of index less than 5, Part 2: Triple points, Internat. J. Math. 23 (2012), no. 3, 1250016, 33, MR2902285, arXiv:1007.2240, DOI:10.1142/S0129167X11007586. MR 2902285
- Scott Morrison and Noah Snyder, Subfactors of index less than 5, Part 1: The principal graph odometer, Comm. Math. Phys. 312 (2012), no. 1, 1–35, MR2914056, arXiv:1007.1730, DOI:10.1007/s00220-012-1426-y. MR 2914056
- David Penneys, Chirality and principal graph obstructions, 2013, arXiv:1307.5890.
- Sorin Popa, *Markov traces on universal Jones algebras and subfactors of finite index*, Invent. Math. **111** (1993), no. 2, 375–405, MR1198815 DDI:10.1007/BF01231293.
- David Penneys and Emily Peters, Calculating two-strand jellyfish relations, 2013, arXiv:1308.5197.

- David Penneys and James E. Tener, Subfactors of index less than 5, Part 4: Vines, Internat. J. Math. 23 (2012), no. 3, 1250017, 18, MR2902286, arXiv:1010.3797, DOI:10.1142/S0129167X11007641. MR 2902286
- Hans Wenzl, Hecke algebras of type A_n and subfactors, Invent. Math. **92** (1988), no. 2, 349–383, MR936086.
- Quantum groups and subfactors of type B, C, and D, Comm. Math. Phys. **133** (1990), no. 2, 383–432, MR1090432.

(4月) (4日) (4日)